arXiv:1601.07520v2 [math.AT] 4 Feb 2016

On freeness of the random fundamental group

Andrew Newman

The Ohio State University

February 5, 2016

Abstract

Let $Y(n,p)$ denote the probability space of random 2-dimensional simplicial complexes in the Linial–Meshulam model, and let $Y \sim Y(n,p)$ denote a random complex chosen according to this distribution. In a paper of Cohen, Costa, Farber, and Kappeler, it is shown that for $p = o(1/n)$ with high probability $\pi_1(Y)$ is free. Following that, a paper of Costa and Farber shows that for values of p which satisfy $3/n < p \ll n^{-46/47}$, with high probability $\pi_1(Y)$ is not free. Here we improve on both of these results to show that there are explicit constants $\gamma_2 < c_2 < 3$, so that for $p < \gamma_2/n$ with high probability Y has free fundamental group and that for $p > c_2/n$, with high probability Y has fundamental group which either is not free or is trivial.

1 Introduction

For positive integers n and d and $p = p(n) \in [0,1]$, the space of Linial–Meshulam random d-dimensional simplicial complexes, first introduced in [9] and [11] and denoted $Y_d(n,p)$, is defined to be the probability space of at-most-d-dimensional simplicial complexes on n vertices with complete $(d-1)$-skeleton where each of the possible $\binom{n}{d+1}$ d-dimensional faces is included independently with probability p. Here we are primarily interested in the $d = 2$ case and so we suppress the dimension parameter and write $Y(n,p)$ for $Y_2(n,p)$. Now the question of the fundamental group of $Y \sim Y(n,p)$ is nontrivial and has been studied in [4], [6], [7], and [8]. Additionally the series of papers [3], [1], [2], and [10], study $Y_d(n,p)$ in the regime $p = c/n$. We will describe these results below, but we introduce two constants first introduced in [3] and [1] that are needed to state our main theorem. Let $\gamma_2 = (2x(1-x))^{-1}$ where x is the unique nonzero solution to $\exp(-\frac{1-x}{2x}) = x$ and let $c_2 = \frac{-\log y}{(1-y)^2}$ where y is the unique root in $(0,1)$ of $3(1-y) + (1+2y)\log y = 0$. Here we build on the work of [3], [7], and [10] to prove the following result about the fundamental group of a random 2-complex. Note that most of the theorems stated here are asymptotic results and we use the phrase "with high probability", abbreviated w.h.p., to mean that a property holds for $Y \sim Y_d(n,p)$ with probability tending to 1 as n tends to infinity. The following theorem is the main result of this paper.

Theorem 1. *If $c < \gamma_2$ and $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$, then with high probability $\pi_1(Y)$ is a free group and if $c > c_2$ and $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$ then with high probability $\pi_1(Y)$ is not a free group.*

Now γ_2 is first defined in [3] and c_2 is first defined in [1] and approximations are computed as $\gamma_2 \approx 2.455407$ and $c_2 \approx 2.753806$.

2 The lower bound

In this section we prove the first part of theorem that for $c < \gamma_2$ one has $\pi_1(Y)$ is a free group with high probability for $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$. This result will follow by adapting the argument of [3] used to prove the following result.

Theorem 2 (2-dimensional case of Theorem 1.4 from [3])**.** *Let γ_2 be as above. If $c < \gamma_2$ then w.h.p. $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$ is 2-collapsible or contains $\partial\Delta_3$ as a subcomplex.*

We first define what it means for a simplicial complex to be d-collapsible. For a d-dimensional simplicial complex Y, we say that a $(d-1)$-dimensional face τ is *free* if it is contained in exactly one d-dimensional face $\sigma \in Y$. For a free $(d-1)$-face τ an *elementary collapse* at τ is defined to be the simplicial complex Y' obtained from Y be removing τ and the unique d-face σ in Y containing τ. If there is a sequence of elementary collapses that removes all d-dimensional faces of Y we say that Y is d-collapsible. Observe that elementary collapses are homotopy equivalences, so if a 2-complex is 2-collapsible (to a graph) then in particular it has free fundamental group. Therefore theorem 2 above almost proves the lower bound except for the problem of tetrahedron boundaries. Note that it is impossible to rule out $\partial\Delta_3$ appearing as a subcomplex of $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$ for any $c > 0$ since the expected number of copies of $\partial\Delta_3$ in $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$ approaches a Poisson distribution with mean $c^4/24$. Additionally, [3] does not state any result about partial collapsibility in the presence of a few copies of $\partial\Delta_3$ and indeed it is not clear that any partial collapsibility result would hold. However such a result is not needed to imply that the fundamental group of $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$ is free for $c < \gamma_2$ as we will see below.

Following the convention of [3] define a *core* to be a 2-dimensional simplicial complex in which every edge is contained in at least two faces. Also for a 2-complex Y, let $R(Y)$ denote the simplicial complex obtained by collapsing all the free edges of Y and let $R_\infty(Y)$ denote the simplicial complex obtained after repeatedly collapsing at all free edges until no free edges remain. The two key results of [3] that we will use are the following.

Theorem 3 (2-dimensional case of Theorem 4.1 from [3])**.** *For every $c > 0$ there exists a constant $\delta = \delta(c) > 0$ such that w.h.p. every core subcomplex K of $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$ with $f_2(K) \leq \delta n^2$ must contain the boundary of a tetrahedron.*

Theorem 4 (2-dimensional case of Theorem 5.3 from [3])**.** *Let $\delta > 0$ and $0 < c < \gamma_2$ be fixed and suppose $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$. Then w.h.p. $f_2(R_\infty(Y)) \leq \delta n^2$.*

Now to bound the probability that $\pi_1(Y)$ is not a free group for $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$, we will bound the probability that $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$ for $c < \gamma_2$ has a core which contains no tetrahedron boundary or has a pair of tetrahedron boundaries that are not face disjoint. This will be an upper bound to the probability that $\pi_1(Y)$ is not free by the following proposition.

Proposition 5. *Let Y be a 2-dimensional simplicial complex. If every core of Y contains a tetrahedron boundary and all the tetrahedron boundaries are face-disjoint then $\pi_1(Y)$ is free*

Proof. Let $\tilde{Y}$ be the 3-dimensional simplicial complex obtained from Y be adding a 3-simplex inside all the tetrahedron boundaries of Y. Now $\tilde{Y}^{(2)} = Y$ so $\pi_1(Y) = \pi_1(\tilde{Y})$. Now let Z be obtained from $\tilde{Y}$ by collapsing at a free 2-dimensional face at every 3-dimensional face, such a collapse will remove

all the tetrahedra from $\tilde{Y}$ as the tetrahedron boundaries in Y are face disjoint so every tetrahedron in $\tilde{Y}$ has that all of its faces are free. Equivalently, Z is obtained from Y by deleting one face from every tetrahedron boundary of Y. Now collapsing at free faces is a homotopy equivalence so $\pi_1(Z) = \pi_1(\tilde{Y})$. Furthermore Z is 2-collapsible. Indeed Z has no cores as a core K of Z would be a core in Y as well since Z is obtained from Y by removing faces. But every core of Y contains a tetrahedron boundary and Z has no tetrahedron boundaries. Since Z does not have a core it must be 2-collapsible, otherwise deleting all the isolated edges of $R_\infty(Z)$ would give us a subcomplex of Z that has no faces of degree zero or one, so such a subcomplex would be a core. Thus Z is 2-collapsible, in particular Z is homotopy equivalent to a graph so $\pi_1(Z)$ is a free group. □

Now we are ready to prove the first part of Theorem 1, that is for $c < \gamma_2$ and $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$, $\pi_1(Y)$ is a free group with high probability.

Proof of lower bound on Theorem 1. Let $c < \gamma_2$ be fixed and suppose $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$, by proposition 5, the probability that $\pi_1(Y)$ is not free is bounded above by the sum of the probability that Y contains tetrahedron boundaries that share a face and the probability that Y has a core with no tetrahedron boundary. First it is easy to bound the probability that Y contains tetrahedron boundaries that share a face. Two tetrahedron boundaries in a simplicial complex sharing a face must meet in exactly one face. Two tetrahedron boundaries meeting at one face is a simplicial complex with 5 vertices and 7 faces, the expected number of such subcomplexes in $Y \sim Y(n, p)$ is $O(n^5 p^7)$ which in this case is $O(c^7/n^2) = o(1)$. So by Markov's inequality the probability that there are tetrahedron boundaries in Y that are not face disjoint is $o(1)$.

We will now use the two theorems from [3] above to show that the probability that Y has a core with no tetrahedron boundary is $o(1)$. Let $\delta = \delta(c)$ be the δ given by Theorem 3. Let $\mathscr{F}$ denote the collection of 2-complexes on n vertices containing a core with no tetrahedron boundary and let $\mathscr{G}$ denote the collection of 2-complexes on n vertices for which all cores have size at most δn^2. Note that if $Y \notin \mathscr{G}$, then $f_2(R_\infty(Y)) > \delta n^2$ since cores are unaffected by elementary collapses, so $Pr(Y \notin \mathscr{G}) = o(1)$ by Theorem 4. Now we bound $Pr(Y \in \mathscr{F})$.

$$\begin{aligned} Pr(Y \in \mathscr{F}) &= Pr(Y \in \mathscr{F} \cap \mathscr{G}) + Pr(Y \in \mathscr{F} \setminus \mathscr{G}) \\ &\leq Pr(Y \in \mathscr{F} \cap \mathscr{G}) + Pr(Y \notin \mathscr{G}) \\ &\leq Pr(Y \in \mathscr{F} \cap \mathscr{G}) + o(1) \\ &\leq Pr(Y \in \{X : X \text{ has a core } K \text{ with at most } \delta n^2 \text{ faces and no } \partial\Delta_3\}) + o(1) \end{aligned}$$

Now by the choice of δ and Theorem 3, we know that the probability that Y has a core which has at most δn^2 faces but no tetrahedron boundary is $o(1)$. Thus we have that $Pr(Y \in \mathscr{F}) = o(1)$ which completes the proof. □

3 The upper bound

We now turn our attention to proving that when $c > c_2$ and $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$, with high probability $\pi_1(Y)$ is not a free group. In fact relevant results by Costa and Farber ([7]) will prove that the cohomological dimension is 2. We refer the reader to [5] for background on group cohomology theory. The main result of [7] is the following:

Theorem 6 (Theorem 2 of [7]). *Assume that $p \ll n^{-46/47}$, then w.h.p. a random 2-complex $Y \sim Y(n,p)$ is asphericable. That is the complex Z obtained from Y by removing one face from each tetrahedron of Y is aspherical (i.e. the universal cover of Z is contractible).*

From here Costa and Farber prove the following result.

Theorem 7 (Theorem 3B of [7]). *For any constants $c > 3$ and $0 < \epsilon < 1/47$ and p satisfying $c/n < p < n^{-1+\epsilon}$, the cohomological dimension of $Y \sim Y(n,p)$ equals 2 with high probability.*

To prove our upper bound from Theorem 1 we will use the following result of Linial and Peled [10] to reduce the constant 3 in Theorem 7 to c_2, the argument will follow exactly the argument of Costa and Farber in their proof of Theorem 7, but with the current state-of-the-art (and best-possible) threshold for emergence of homology in degree 2 for a random 2-complex.

Theorem 8 (Special case of Theorem 1.3 from [10]). *Suppose $c > c_2$, then w.h.p. $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$ has*

$$\dim H_2(Y;\mathbb{R}) = \Theta(n^2).$$

In [10], the constant implicit in "$\Theta(n^2)$" is given explicitly, but we do not need it here. We are now ready to prove the second part of theorem 1.

Proof of upper bound on Theorem 1. Fix $c > c_2$ and suppose that Y is a simplicial complex drawn from $Y(n, c/n)$. Now let Z be obtained from Y by removing one face from every tetrahedron boundary. With high probability $\pi_1(Y) = \pi_1(Z)$, and by theorem 6, Z is aspherical. Therefore showing that $\beta_2(Z) \neq 0$ would imply that the cohomological dimension of $\pi_1(Y)$ is at least two. Now by theorem 8 we know that with high probability $\beta_2(Y) = \Theta(n^2)$. Also we have by a first moment argument that the expected number of tetrahedron boundaries is bounded above by $c^4/24$. Therefore by Markov's inequality with high probability Y has no more than, say, n tetrahedron boundaries. Now given a 2-dimensional simplicial complex, removing a face can drop β_2 by at most one. Therefore when we remove one face from from each tetrahedron boundary of Y to obtain Z we drop $\beta_2(Y)$ by at most n, then w.h.p. $\beta_2(Z) = \Theta(n^2) > 0$. Thus $cd(\pi_1(Y)) \geq 2$ (actually equality holds by theorem 6), in particular $\pi_1(Y)$ is not a free group. □

4 Concluding Remarks

The statement of theorem 1 perhaps implicitly suggests a sharp threshold for the property that a random 2-complex has fundamental group which is not free. However, it is worth mentioning that the property that the fundamental group of a simplicial complex is free is not a monotone property, so it is not obvious at all that a sharp threshold should exist. However, by theorem 1 and theorem 7, for $c_2/n < p < 3\log n/n$ and $Y \sim Y(n,p)$, with high probability $\pi_1(Y)$ is not free. Combining this with a result from [8] that for $p > (2\log n + \omega(n))/n$ (with $\omega(n) \to \infty$ as $n \to \infty$) and $Y \sim Y(n,p)$, $\pi_1(Y)$ has property (T) with high probability, we have that for $p > c_2/n$, the fundamental group of $Y \sim Y(n,p)$ is with high probability free only if it is trivial as the only free group with property (T) is the trivial group. On the other hand, [6] proves that for $p = o(1/n)$, $Y \sim Y(n,p)$ collapses to a graph with high probability. Thus we do have at least a coarse threshold of $1/n$ for the fundamental group of a random 2-complex to be either not free or trivial.

It remains to uncover what happens for $\gamma_2 \leq c \leq c_2$ and $p = c/n$. Right now, there does not seem to be enough evidence to establish a conjecture. It could be that for $p \in [\gamma_2/n, c_2/n]$ there is a positive probability that $Y \sim Y(n,p)$ has a free fundamental group and a positive probability that it does not. Or perhaps there is some $c \in [\gamma_2, c_2]$ so that c/n is a sharp threshold for the fundamental group of a random 2-complex to be not free. Other possibilities could exist too, so we do not yet make a conjecture about a sharp threshold or the absence of a sharp threshold for the property that a random 2-complex has a non-free fundamental group.

Now it is known that γ_2/n is the sharp threshold for 2-collapsibility for $Y \sim Y(n,p)$ in the absence of $\partial\Delta_3$ by [3] and [2], and that c_2/n is the sharp threshold for emergence of $H_2(Y, \mathbb{R})$, or $H_2(Y, \mathbb{Z})$, that does not arise from copies of $\partial\Delta_3$ for $Y \sim Y(n,p)$ by [1] and [10]. Therefore a new approach will likely be needed to understand the fundamental group of $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$ for $c \in [\gamma_2, c_2]$. One possible direction of future study is to try to understand torsion in $H_1(Y)$ for $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$. Obviously, for any simplicial complex Y if $H_1(Y)$ has torsion then $\pi_1(Y)$ is not free. The authors of [10] conjecture that $H_2(Y, -)$is generated by copies of $\partial\Delta_3$ w.h.p. for $c < c_2$ and $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$ for any coefficient ring. If it could be shown that for $c < c_2$ one has w.h.p. that $H_2(Y, -)$ is generated by copies of $\partial\Delta_3$ for *all* coefficient rings, then by the universal coefficient theorem, $H_1(Y)$ would be torsion free for $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$ with $c < c_2$, so analyzing torsion in H_1 would not show that the fundamental group is not free. Regardless, the question of torsion in $H_1(Y)$ for $Y \sim Y(n, c/n)$ is an interesting question on its own and potentially could provide useful information about the fundamental group, and so we close with the following two questions.

Question 1. Is there a sharp threshold $p = c/n$ for the property that a random 2-dimensional simplicial complex has fundamental group that is either trivial or not free? And if so, what is that threshold?

Question 2. What can be said about torsion in degree-1 homology for random 2-complexes, particularly for $p = c/n$ and $c \geq \gamma_2$? More generally, what can be said about torsion in degree-$(d-1)$ homology for random d-complexes?

References

[1] L. Aronshtam and N.Linial, *When does top homology in a random simplicial complex vanish?*, Random Structures & Algorithms **46** (2013), 26–35.

[2] ———, *The threshold for d-collapsibility in random complexes*, Random Structures & Algorithms **48** (2015), 260–269.

[3] L. Aronshtam, N.Linial, T. Łuczak, and R. Meshulam, *Collapsibility and vanishing of top homology in random simplicial complexes.*, Discrete & Computational Geometry **49** (2013), 317–334.

[4] E. Babson, C. Hoffman, and M. Kahle, *The fundamental group of random 2-complexes*, Journal of the American Mathematical Society **24** (2011), 1–28.

[5] K.S. Brown, *Cohomology of groups*, Springer-Verlag New York Inc., 1982.

[6] D. Cohen, A. Costa, M. Farber, and T. Kappeler, *Topology of random 2-complexes*, Discrete & Computational Geometry **47** (2012), 117–149.

[7] A. Costa and M. Farber, *The asphericity of random 2-dimensional complexes*, Random Structures & Algorithms **46** (2015), 261–273.

[8] C. Hoffman, M.Kahle, and E.Paquette, *Spectral gaps of random graphs and applications to random topology*, arXiv: 1201.0425.

[9] N. Linial and R. Meshulam, *Homological connectivity of random 2-complexes*, Combinatorica **26** (2006), 475–487.

[10] N. Linial and Y. Peled, *On the phase transition in random simplicial complexes*, arXiv: 1410.1281.

[11] R. Meshulam and N. Wallach, *Homological connectivity of random k-dimensional complexes*, Random Structures & Algorithms **34** (2009), 408–417.